Report of Voting/Annex B

MEMBER BODY	COMMENTS	OBSERVATIONS OF THE PROJECT
FR-25-1	**ISSUE NUMBER: FR-1** **ORIGINATOR**: P. Huau,GOSET,pascalhuau@compuserve.com **SENTENCE/ABSTRACT/KEYWORD**: **DESCRIPTION**: All the ISO 10303 standards have a clause Information object registration. This clause provide unique identifiers for the schemas that are defined in the document, identifiers that are useful when the schemas are corrected or amended. This document has not such a clause. Why? **PROPOSED SOLUTION**: Add an Information object registration clause. **PROJECT LEADER RESOLUTION** Annex B in the document of the DIS version has been added. It describes the object registration clause.	ACCEPTED
FR-25-2	**ORIGINATOR**: P. Huau,GOSET,pascalhuau@compuserve.com **SENTENCE/ABSTRACT/KEYWORD**: **DESCRIPTION**: According to the editorial directives, the index shall have only one column. **PROPOSED SOLUTION**: Provide the index in a single-column format. **PROJECT LEADER RESOLUTION** An index in a single column format has been provided.	ACCEPTED
FR-25-3	**ORIGINATOR**: P. Huau,GOSET,pascalhuau@compuserve.com **SENTENCE/ABSTRACT/KEYWORD**: **DESCRIPTION**: Having a specific Express schema for each conformance class is not a good way to have the standard implemented (Implementors usually do not want to implement multiple schemas as it leads to	ACCEPTED

	Date 2001-12-03	ISO/CD 13584 - 25
	Secretariat ANSI/NIST	ISO TC184/SC4/WG2 N559

MEMBER BODY	COMMENTS	OBSERVATIONS OF THE PROJECT
	develop multiple software). It would be better to have a single Express schema and to specify, per conformance class, which concepts can be left unprocessed. NB: an implementor shall always be free to implement all the entities. A conformance class only identifies the minimum subset of entities in an Express schema a reading interface shall fully interpret. **PROPOSED SOLUTION**: Define conformance classes as list of entities, selected in a single Express schema, to be interpreted **PROJECT LEADER RESOLUTION** Done like in Part 24.	
FR-25-4	**ORIGINATOR**: P. Huau,GOSET,pascalhuau@compuserve.com **SENTENCE/ABSTRACT/KEYWORD**: **DESCRIPTION**: The scope clause lists among other scope items the following one: "description of assembled parts that may contain an unlimited number of constituent components" The only way to describe such assemblies using ISO 10303 resources is to use resources defined in ISO 10303-44 (e.g. assembly_component_usage_occurrence). But the present part does not use these resources. Therefore, either the scope item is not covered, or it is covered in a way that makes it not interoperable with description of assemblies made with STEP APs (203, 214, …). **PROPOSED SOLUTION**: Describe assembled part using ISO 10303-44 constructs or remove the scope item. **PROJECT LEADER RESOLUTION** No action. ISO 10303-44 describes explicitly one particular assembly. PLIB describes explicitly or implicitly classes of assembly classes.	NO ACTION
FR-25-5	**ORIGINATOR**: P. Huau,GOSET,pascalhuau@compuserve.com **SENTENCE/ABSTRACT/KEYWORD**: **DESCRIPTION**: Normative references of ISO 10303-41 and -42 are outdated. Both documents have had a 2nd edition in 2000.	ACCEPTED

Date 2001-12-03	ISO/CD 13584 - 25
Secretariat ANSI/NIST	ISO TC184/SC4/WG2 N559

MEMBER BODY	COMMENTS	OBSERVATIONS OF THE PROJECT
	PROPOSED SOLUTION: Update the normative references. **PROJECT LEADER RESOLUTION** Accepted. Normative references have been updated.	
FR-25-6	**ORIGINATOR**: P. Huau,GOSET,pascalhuau@compuserve.com **SENTENCE/ABSTRACT/KEYWORD**: **CLAUSE:** 5.4.1.1 **DESCRIPTION**: The rule does not take into account the fact that there are other ISO document statuses than the one listed (e.g. TS, TC, …) **PROPOSED SOLUTION**: Update the normative references. **RESOLUTION**. This comment requests a change in part 24. The following change has been implemented in part 24: 2- In clause D.4.1 of ISO 13584-25: Introduce 'TS', 'PAS', 'ITA'. in the rule **PROJECT LEADER RESOLUTION** Accepted. Implemented in the new version of ISO 13584-25. The rule has been modified to handle these new features.	ACCEPTED
FR-25-7	**ORIGINATOR**: P. Huau,GOSET,pascalhuau@compuserve.com **SENTENCE/ABSTRACT/KEYWORD**: **CLAUSE:** annex B.4.1 **DESCRIPTION**: The role of this annex with respect to the conformance classes is unclear. If it defines additional constraints for the conformance classes, then it should be referred to in the clauses that describe each conformance class. **PROPOSED SOLUTION**: Clarify the role of annex B.4.1 **RESOLUTION:** NO ACTION.	NO ACTION
FR-25-8	**ORIGINATOR**: P. Huau,GOSET,pascalhuau@compuserve.com **SENTENCE/ABSTRACT/KEYWORD**:	ACCEPTED

MEMBER BODY	COMMENTS	OBSERVATIONS OF THE PROJECT
	CLAUSE: annex B.4.1 **DESCRIPTION**: There is no need of a B.4.1 as there is no B.4.2 **PROPOSED SOLUTION**: Remove one level. **PROJECT LEADER RESOLUTION** Accepted. The level has been removed in the new version of ISO 13584-25.	
FR-25-9	**ORIGINATOR**: P. Huau,GOSET,pascalhuau@compuserve.com **SENTENCE/ABSTRACT/KEYWORD**: **CLAUSE:** annex B.4.1 **DESCRIPTION**: Functions defined in clauses B.4.1.2/.3/.4 could easily become common resources for SC4. In order to enable that promotion, they should be: - included in an Express schema (as little as possible) - the "_25" should be removed (as it does not provide any benefit) **PROPOSED SOLUTION**: **RESOLUTION:** Deferred.	DEFERRED
FR-25-10	**ORIGINATOR**: G. Pierra **SENTENCE/ABSTRACT/KEYWORD**: Aggregate_value **CLAUSE:** 7.3.2. Aggregate_value **DESCRIPTION**: Aggregate_value uses the AGGREGATE EXPRESS data type. this is not allowed. **PROPOSED SOLUTION**: Accepted	
FR-25-11	**ORIGINATOR**: G. Pierra **SENTENCE/ABSTRACT/KEYWORD**: EXPRESS-G, Aggregate_value **CLAUSE:** Annex D, Figure D2 **DESCRIPTION**: Aggregate_value uses the AGGREGATE EXPRESS data type. this is not allowed.	ACCEPTED

MEMBER BODY	COMMENTS	OBSERVATIONS OF THE PROJECT
	PROPOSED SOLUTION: The EXPRESS-G has been replaced	
FR-25-12	**ORIGINATOR**: G. Pierra **SENTENCE/ABSTRACT/KEYWORD**: EXPRESS-G, Aggregate_type **CLAUSE:** Annex D, Figure D1 **DESCRIPTION**: EXPRESS-G of Aggregate_type does not reflect its definition **PROPOSED SOLUTION**: The EXPRESS-G has been replaced	ACCEPTED
FR-25-13	**ORIGINATOR**: G. Pierra **SENTENCE/ABSTRACT/KEYWORD**: EXPRESS-G, Aggregate_type **CLAUSE:** 7 **DESCRIPTION**: Error in schema name. In clause 7, the schema name is ISO13584_aggregate_value_schema and not ISO13584_IEC61360_dictionary_aggregate_value_schema as it appears in the tiles **PROPOSED SOLUTION**: REPLACE every where : ISO13584_IEC61360_dictionary_aggregate_value_schema BY ISO13584_aggregate_value_schema **PROJECT LEADER RESOLUTION** Accepted. Implemented in the new version of ISO13584-25	ACCEPTED
FR-25-14	**ORIGINATOR**: G. Pierra **SENTENCE/ABSTRACT/KEYWORD**: Entity short name **CLAUSE:** **DESCRIPTION**: Entity short names are not provided in the document **PROPOSED SOLUTION**: Provide entity short name **PROJECT LEADER RESOLUTION** Accepted. Short names have been provided in the new version of ISO13584-25	ACCEPTED
FR-24-1	**AUTHOR** G. Pierra **CLAUSE** 16.1.2 and 17.1.1.1 no_content_without_DET_rule **CLASSIFICATION Minor Technical**	ACCEPTED

MEMBER BODY	COMMENTS	OBSERVATIONS OF THE PROJECT
	DESCRIPTION it should be possible to partially exchange a dictionary or a library at what ever level of granularity. The **no_content_without_DET_rule** forbid to exchange a **dictionary_definition** without its corresponding **content_item** if it exists, and to exchange a **content_item** without its corresponding **dictionary_definition**. This rule was introduced when ISO 13584-24 supported inheritance of content of **content_item**s, and in particular of content of class extension (for instance a derivation function defined in some superclass was inherited by all its subclasses). This rule ensured that when all dictionary_definitions of the superclasses of some class were available in some context, all the existing content_items of these classes were also available, and therefore the class was completely known. In the current version of ISO 13584-24, inheritance of content is no longer supported and therefore there is no reason to maintain this constraint. **PROPOSED SOLUTION** Remove the constraint and all the corresponding wording	
FR-24-2	**ISSUE NUMBER: FRA 24-2** **AUTHOR** G. Pierra **CLAUSE** Annex C, **CLASSIFICATION Major TECHNICAL** **DESCRIPTION Providing a simpler way to build implicit long forms** Currently, only an algorithm is specified for the various parts of ISO 13584 to build long forms of: 1 LIIM + n VEP by integrating various schemas. This method is complex and not reliable by lack of reliability of existing EXPRESS tools to build long forms. **PROPOSED SOLUTION** It is suggested to introduce another process:	ACCEPTED
USA-25-1	**AUTHOR:** Gerald Radack **CLAUSE:** General **CLASSIFICATION:** MINOR/EDITORIAL **DESCRIPTION**: Colons are preceded with a space throughout the document. **PROPOSED SOLUTION**: Remove the spaces before colons. **RESOLUTION:**	ACCEPTED

	Date 2001-12-03	ISO/CD 13584 - 25
	Secretariat ANSI/NIST	ISO TC184/SC4/WG2 N559

MEMBER BODY	COMMENTS	OBSERVATIONS OF THE PROJECT
	PROJECT LEADER RESOLUTION Accepted. Implemented in the new version of ISO13584-25	
USA-25-2	**AUTHOR:** Gerald Radack **CLAUSE:** General **CLASSIFICATION:** MINOR/EDITORIAL **DESCRIPTION**: Many references to standards have a space after the colon, e.g., "ISO 10303-11: 1994". **PROPOSED SOLUTION**: Remove the spaces. **RESOLUTION:** **PROJECT LEADER RESOLUTION** Accepted. Implemented in the new version of ISO13584-25	ACCEPTED
USA-25-3	**AUTHOR:** Gerald Radack **CLAUSE:** General **CLASSIFICATION:** MINOR/EDITORIAL **DESCRIPTION**: Level 2 headings are indented. **PROPOSED SOLUTION**: Make them flush with the left margin. **RESOLUTION:** **PROJECT LEADER RESOLUTION** Accepted. Implemented in the new version of ISO13584-25	ACCEPTED
USA-25-4	**AUTHOR:** Gerald Radack **CLAUSE:** General **CLASSIFICATION:** MINOR/EDITORIAL **DESCRIPTION**: EXPRESS code is formatted inconsistenly. **PROPOSED SOLUTION**: Be consistent about things such as spaces before and after parentheses and operators, indenting. Do not put spaces before semicolons. Capitalize reserved words, including built-in types such as "INTEGER" and "BOOLEAN". **RESOLUTION:** **PROJECT LEADER RESOLUTION** Accepted. Indentation of the EXPRESS Code has been implemented in the new version of ISO13584-25	ACCEPTED
USA-25-5	**AUTHOR:** Gerald Radack	ACCEPTED

MEMBER BODY	COMMENTS	OBSERVATIONS OF THE PROJECT
	CLAUSE: Foreword **CLASSIFICATION:** MINOR/EDITORIAL **DESCRIPTION**: The heading is not properly formatted. **PROPOSED SOLUTION**: **RESOLUTION:** **PROJECT LEADER RESOLUTION** Accepted. Implemented in the new version of ISO13584-25	
USA-25-6	**AUTHOR:** Gerald Radack **CLAUSE:** Introduction **CLASSIFICATION:** MINOR/EDITORIAL **DESCRIPTION**: The reference to ISO 13584-24:-- should include the footnote "To be published". **PROPOSED SOLUTION**: **RESOLUTION:** **PROJECT LEADER RESOLUTION** Accepted. Implemented in the new version of ISO13584-25	ACCEPTED
USA-25-7	**AUTHOR:** Gerald Radack **CLAUSE:** 3.20 **CLASSIFICATION:** MINOR/EDITORIAL **DESCRIPTION**: The term "library delivery file" is defined in ISO 13584-24, but there is no cross reference. **PROPOSED SOLUTION**: Add the reference "[ISO 13584-24:--]. **RESOLUTION:** **PROJECT LEADER RESOLUTION** Accepted. Implemented in the new version of ISO13584-25	ACCEPTED
USA-25-8	**AUTHOR:** Gerald Radack **CLAUSE:** 3.22 **CLASSIFICATION:** MINOR/EDITORIAL **DESCRIPTION**: The term "library part data" is defined in ISO 13584-24, but there is no cross reference. **PROPOSED SOLUTION**: Add the reference "[ISO 13584-24:--]. **RESOLUTION:** **PROJECT LEADER RESOLUTION**	ACCEPTED

MEMBER BODY	COMMENTS	OBSERVATIONS OF THE PROJECT
	Accepted. Implemented in the new version of ISO13584-25	
USA-25-9	**AUTHOR:** Gerald Radack **CLAUSE:** 3.23 **CLASSIFICATION:** MINOR/EDITORIAL **DESCRIPTION**: The term "library part data" is defined in ISO 13584-24, but there is no cross reference. **PROPOSED SOLUTION**: Add the reference "[ISO 13584-24:--]. **RESOLUTION:** **PROJECT LEADER RESOLUTION** Accepted. Implemented in the new version of ISO13584-25	ACCEPTED
USA-25-10	**AUTHOR:** Gerald Radack **CLAUSE:** 3.23 **CLASSIFICATION:** MINOR/EDITORIAL **DESCRIPTION**: The term "library exchange context" is defined in ISO 13584-24, but there is no cross reference. **PROPOSED SOLUTION**: Add the reference "[ISO 13584-24:--]. **RESOLUTION:** **PROJECT LEADER RESOLUTION** Accepted. Implemented in the new version of ISO13584-25	ACCEPTED
USA-25-11	**AUTHOR:** Gerald Radack **CLAUSE:** 3.24 **CLASSIFICATION:** MINOR/EDITORIAL **DESCRIPTION**: The term "library external file" is defined in ISO 13584-24, but there is no cross reference. **PROPOSED SOLUTION**: Add the reference "[ISO 13584-24:--]. **RESOLUTION:** **PROJECT LEADER RESOLUTION** Accepted. Implemented in the new version of ISO13584-25	ACCEPTED
USA-25-12	**AUTHOR:** Gerald Radack **CLAUSE:** 3.25 **CLASSIFICATION:** MINOR/EDITORIAL **DESCRIPTION**: The term "library integrated information model" is defined in ISO 13584-24, but	ACCEPTED

MEMBER BODY	COMMENTS	OBSERVATIONS OF THE PROJECT
	there is no cross reference. **PROPOSED SOLUTION**: Add the reference "[ISO 13584-24:--]. **RESOLUTION:** **PROJECT LEADER RESOLUTION** Accepted. Implemented in the new version of ISO13584-25	
USA-25-13	**AUTHOR:** Gerald Radack **CLAUSE:** 3.26 **CLASSIFICATION:** MINOR/EDITORIAL **DESCRIPTION**: The term "library specification of a class" is defined in ISO 13584-24, but there is no cross reference. **PROPOSED SOLUTION**: Add the reference "[ISO 13584-24:--]. **RESOLUTION:** **PROJECT LEADER RESOLUTION** Accepted. Implemented in the new version of ISO13584-25	ACCEPTED
USA-25-14	**AUTHOR:** Gerald Radack **CLAUSE:** 3.33 **CLASSIFICATION:** MINOR/EDITORIAL **DESCRIPTION**: The term "view exchange protocol" is defined in ISO 13584-24, but there is no cross reference. **PROPOSED SOLUTION**: Add the reference "[ISO 13584-24:--]. **RESOLUTION:** **PROJECT LEADER RESOLUTION** Accepted. Implemented in the new version of ISO13584-25	ACCEPTED
USA-25-15	**AUTHOR:** Gerald Radack **CLAUSE:** 3.34 **CLASSIFICATION:** MINOR/EDITORIAL **DESCRIPTION**: If there is only one note in a section, it should not be numbered. **PROPOSED SOLUTION**: Change "NOTE 1" to "NOTE". **RESOLUTION:** **PROJECT LEADER RESOLUTION** Accepted. Implemented in the new version of ISO13584-25	ACCEPTED
USA-25-16	**AUTHOR:** Gerald Radack	ACCEPTED

	Date 2001-12-03	ISO/CD 13584 - 25
	Secretariat ANSI/NIST	ISO TC184/SC4/WG2 N559

MEMBER BODY	COMMENTS	OBSERVATIONS OF THE PROJECT
	CLAUSE: 4 **CLASSIFICATION:** MINOR/EDITORIAL **DESCRIPTION**: In the second bullet item, "from the LIIM 25 different parts" does not make sense. Also, the sentence is too long. **PROPOSED SOLUTION**: Change to: Library integrated information model LIIM 25 gathers the above resource constructs with other generic resource constructs from other parts of ISO 13584 and from ISO 10303 into a single schema for representing supplier libraries. That schema includes aggregate data types and aggregate values and explicitly describes class extensions as sets of instances." **RESOLUTION:** **PROJECT LEADER RESOLUTION** Accepted. Implemented in the new version of ISO13584-25	
USA-25-17	**AUTHOR:** Gerald Radack **CLAUSE:** 4 **CLASSIFICATION:** MINOR/EDITORIAL **DESCRIPTION**: The second list item is improperly indented. **PROPOSED SOLUTION**: **RESOLUTION:** **PROJECT LEADER RESOLUTION** Accepted. Implemented in the new version of ISO13584-25	ACCEPTED
USA-25-18	**AUTHOR:** Gerald Radack **CLAUSE:** 4 **CLASSIFICATION:** MINOR/EDITORIAL **DESCRIPTION**: "values are modeled in total conformance": the word "total" is redundant. **PROPOSED SOLUTION**: Remove the word "total". **RESOLUTION:** **PROJECT LEADER RESOLUTION** Accepted. Implemented in the new version of ISO13584-25	ACCEPTED
USA-25-19	**AUTHOR:** Gerald Radack **CLAUSE:** 4.1.1 **CLASSIFICATION:** MINOR/EDITORIAL **DESCRIPTION**: The year is missing from the reference "IEC 6136-2".	ACCEPTED

MEMBER BODY	COMMENTS	OBSERVATIONS OF THE PROJECT
	PROPOSED SOLUTION: Add the year. **RESOLUTION:** **PROJECT LEADER RESOLUTION** Accepted. Implemented in the new version of ISO13584-25	
USA-25-20	**AUTHOR:** Gerald Radack **CLAUSE:** 4.2 **CLASSIFICATION:** MINOR/EDITORIAL **DESCRIPTION**: "Each of these kind of libraries" is not proper English. **PROPOSED SOLUTION**: Change to: "Each of the above kinds of libraries." **RESOLUTION:** **PROJECT LEADER RESOLUTION** Accepted. Implemented in the new version of ISO13584-25	ACCEPTED
USA-25-21	**AUTHOR:** Gerald Radack **CLAUSE:** 4.2 **CLASSIFICATION:** MINOR/EDITORIAL **DESCRIPTION**: "allows to use the resource constructs" is not proper English. **PROPOSED SOLUTION**: Change to: "allows the use of the resource constructs". **RESOLUTION:** **PROJECT LEADER RESOLUTION** Accepted. Implemented in the new version of ISO13584-25	ACCEPTED
USA-25-22	**AUTHOR:** Gerald Radack **CLAUSE:** 4.2 **CLASSIFICATION:** MINOR/EDITORIAL **DESCRIPTION**: The last list item is not indented properly. **PROPOSED SOLUTION**: **RESOLUTION:** **PROJECT LEADER RESOLUTION** Accepted. Implemented in the new version of ISO13584-25	ACCEPTED
USA-25-23	**AUTHOR:** Gerald Radack **CLAUSE:** 4.2.2 **CLASSIFICATION:** MINOR/EDITORIAL **DESCRIPTION**: "standard data, that": the comma does not belong. "library delivery file conform	ACCEPTED

MEMBER BODY	COMMENTS	OBSERVATIONS OF THE PROJECT
	to" is not proper English. "Conformance requirements to conformance class": the word "to" is improper. **PROPOSED SOLUTION**: Remove the comma. Change "conform" to "conforming". Change "to" to "for" in the last sentence. **RESOLUTION:** **PROJECT LEADER RESOLUTION** Accepted. Implemented in the new version of ISO13584-25	
USA-25-24	**AUTHOR:** Gerald Radack **CLAUSE:** 4.2.2 **CLASSIFICATION:** MINOR/EDITORIAL **DESCRIPTION**: "Together with the standard data specified in annex B and with the implementation methods specified in annex C, ISO13584_short_form_CC1_schema specifies conformance class 1 of the library integrated information model LIIM 25." The schema does not specify a conformance class. Also, the schema name should be preceded by "the". **PROPOSED SOLUTION**: Change to: "Conformance class 1 of library integrated information model LIIM 25 is defined by the ISO13584_short_form_CC1_schema together with the standard data specified in annex B and with the implementation methods specified in annex C." **RESOLUTION:** **PROJECT LEADER RESOLUTION** No longer applicable.	NO LONGER APPLICABLE
USA-25-25	**AUTHOR:** Gerald Radack **CLAUSE:** 4.2.3 **CLASSIFICATION:** MINOR/EDITORIAL **DESCRIPTION**: "Together with the standard data specified in annex B and with the implementation methods specified in annex C, ISO13584_short_form_CC2_schema specifies conformance class 1 of the library integrated information model LIIM 25." The schema does not specify a conformance class. Also, the schema name should be preceded by "the". **PROPOSED SOLUTION**: Change to: "Conformance class 2 of library integrated information model LIIM 25 is defined by the ISO13584_short_form_CC2_schema together with the standard	NO LONGER APPLICABLE

MEMBER BODY	COMMENTS	OBSERVATIONS OF THE PROJECT
	data specified in annex B and with the implementation methods specified in annex C." **RESOLUTION: PROJECT LEADER RESOLUTION** No longer applicable	
USA-25-26	**AUTHOR:** Gerald Radack **CLAUSE:** 4.2.3 **CLASSIFICATION:** MINOR/EDITORIAL **DESCRIPTION**: "standard data, that": the comma does not belong. "library delivery file conform to" is not proper English. "Conformance requirements to conformance class": the word "to" is improper. **PROPOSED SOLUTION**: Remove the comma. Change "conform" to "conforming". Change "to" to "for" in the last sentence. **RESOLUTION: PROJECT LEADER RESOLUTION** Accepted. Implemented in the new version of ISO13584-25	ACCEPTED
USA-25-27	**AUTHOR:** Gerald Radack **CLAUSE:** 4.2.4 **CLASSIFICATION:** MINOR/EDITORIAL **DESCRIPTION**: "Together with the standard data specified in annex B and with the implementation methods specified in annex C, ISO13584_short_form_CC3_schema specifies conformance class 1 of the library integrated information model LIIM 25." The schema does not specify a conformance class. Also, the schema name should be preceded by "the". **PROPOSED SOLUTION**: Change to: "Conformance class 3 of library integrated information model LIIM 25 is defined by the ISO13584_short_form_CC3_schema together with the standard data specified in annex B and with the implementation methods specified in annex C." **RESOLUTION: PROJECT LEADER RESOLUTION** No longer applicable	NO LONGER APPLICABLE
USA-25-28	**AUTHOR:** Gerald Radack	ACCEPTED

MEMBER BODY	COMMENTS	OBSERVATIONS OF THE PROJECT
	CLAUSE: 4.2.4 **CLASSIFICATION:** MINOR/EDITORIAL **DESCRIPTION**: "standard data, that": the comma does not belong. "library delivery file conform to" is not proper English. "Conformance requirements to conformance class": the word "to" is improper. **PROPOSED SOLUTION**: Remove the comma. Change "conform" to "conforming". Change "to" to "for" in the last sentence. **RESOLUTION:** **PROJECT LEADER RESOLUTION** Accepted. Implemented in the new version of ISO13584-25	
USA-25-29	**AUTHOR:** Gerald Radack **CLAUSE:** 4.2.5 **CLASSIFICATION:** MINOR/EDITORIAL **DESCRIPTION**: "Together with the standard data specified in annex B and with the implementation methods specified in annex C, ISO13584_short_form_CC1_schema specifies conformance class 4 of the library integrated information model LIIM 25." The schema does not specify a conformance class. The schema name should be preceded by "the". Also, the CC4 schema should specify conformance class 4. **PROPOSED SOLUTION**: Change to: "Conformance class 4 of library integrated information model LIIM 25 is defined by the ISO13584_short_form_CC4_schema together with the standard data specified in annex B and with the implementation methods specified in annex C." **RESOLUTION:** **PROJECT LEADER RESOLUTION** No longer applicable	NO LONGER APPLICABLE
USA-25-30	**AUTHOR:** Gerald Radack **CLAUSE:** 4.2.5 **CLASSIFICATION:** MINOR/EDITORIAL **DESCRIPTION**: The widths of the boxes in the heading of Table 1 do not match the boxes on the following rows. **PROPOSED SOLUTION**: **RESOLUTION:**	NO LONGER APPLICABLE

	Date 2001-12-03	ISO/CD 13584 - 25
	Secretariat ANSI/NIST	ISO TC184/SC4/WG2 N559

MEMBER BODY	COMMENTS	OBSERVATIONS OF THE PROJECT
	PROJECT LEADER RESOLUTION No longer applicable.	
USA-25-31	**AUTHOR:** Gerald Radack **CLAUSE:** 6 **CLASSIFICATION:** MINOR/EDITORIAL **DESCRIPTION**: "declaration introduces ISO13584_IEC61360_dictionary_aggregate_extension_schema block": the schema names should be preceded by "the". Also, the word "block" does not fit. **PROPOSED SOLUTION**: Change to: "declaration introduces the ISO13584_IEC61360_dictionary_aggregate_extension_schema". **RESOLUTION:** **PROJECT LEADER RESOLUTION** Accepted. Implemented in the new version of ISO13584-25	ACCEPTED
USA-25-32	**AUTHOR:** Gerald Radack **CLAUSE:** 6.1 **CLASSIFICATION:** MINOR/EDITORIAL **DESCRIPTION**: The second list item is improperly indented. **PROPOSED SOLUTION**: **RESOLUTION:** **PROJECT LEADER RESOLUTION** Accepted. Implemented in the new version of ISO13584-25	ACCEPTED
USA-25-33	**AUTHOR:** Gerald Radack **CLAUSE:** 6.1 **CLASSIFICATION:** MINOR/EDITORIAL **DESCRIPTION**: "specialisations": incorrect spelling. **PROPOSED SOLUTION**: Change to "specializations". **RESOLUTION:** **PROJECT LEADER RESOLUTION** Accepted. Implemented in the new version of ISO13584-25	ACCEPTED
USA-25-34	**AUTHOR:** Gerald Radack **CLAUSE:** 6.1 **CLASSIFICATION:** MINOR/EDITORIAL	ACCEPTED

MEMBER BODY	COMMENTS	OBSERVATIONS OF THE PROJECT
	DESCRIPTION: "the entity_instance_type_for_aggregateprovides for referencing a EXPRESS-defined entities that specify aggregate data types. The entity_instance_type_for_aggregateentity is obtained by subtyping the entity_instance_type." **PROPOSED SOLUTION**: Change to: "the entity_instance_type_for_aggregate entity provides the means to reference EXPRESS-defined entities that specify aggregate data types. The entity_instance_type_for_aggregate entity is a subtype of the entity_instance_type entity." **RESOLUTION**: **PROJECT LEADER RESOLUTION** Accepted. Implemented in the new version of ISO13584-25	
USA-25-35	**AUTHOR:** Gerald Radack **CLAUSE:** 6.1 **CLASSIFICATION:** MINOR/EDITORIAL **DESCRIPTION**: "this provides": What provides? **PROPOSED SOLUTION**: Change to: "The ISO13584_IEC61360_dictionary_aggregate_extension_schema provides". **RESOLUTION**: **PROJECT LEADER RESOLUTION** Accepted. Implemented in the new version of ISO13584-25	ACCEPTED
USA-25-36	**AUTHOR:** Gerald Radack **CLAUSE:** 6.3.1 **CLASSIFICATION:** MINOR/EDITORIAL **DESCRIPTION**: "The entity_instance_type_for_aggregateentity": space missing before "entity". **PROPOSED SOLUTION**: Add the space. **RESOLUTION**: **PROJECT LEADER RESOLUTION** Accepted. Implemented in the new version of ISO13584-25	ACCEPTED
USA-25-37	**AUTHOR:** Gerald Radack **CLAUSE:** 6.3.3 **CLASSIFICATION:** MINOR/EDITORIAL **DESCRIPTION**: There are two periods at the end of the sentence. **PROPOSED SOLUTION**: Remove a period. **RESOLUTION**:	ACCEPTED

Date 2001-12-03	ISO/CD 13584 - 25
Secretariat ANSI/NIST	ISO TC184/SC4/WG2 N559

MEMBER BODY	COMMENTS	OBSERVATIONS OF THE PROJECT
	PROJECT LEADER RESOLUTION Accepted. Implemented in the new version of ISO13584-25	
USA-25-38	**AUTHOR:** Gerald Radack **CLAUSE:** 6.3.3 **CLASSIFICATION:** MINOR/EDITORIAL **DESCRIPTION**: "integer" and "Boolean": be consistent about capitalization. Reserved words are usually given in all capitals. **PROPOSED SOLUTION**: Change to "INTEGER" and "BOOLEAN". **RESOLUTION:** **PROJECT LEADER RESOLUTION** No longer applicable	NO LONGER APPLICABLE
USA-25-39	**AUTHOR:** Gerald Radack **CLAUSE:** 6.3.4 **CLASSIFICATION:** MINOR/TECHNICAL **DESCRIPTION**: Why are start_index and end_index defined for set_type? A set does not have indices. However, it does have an optional lower and upper bound, which represent the minimum and maximum number of elements in the set. Also, the attribute definitions talk about lists, but this is the set_type. **PROPOSED SOLUTION**: Change "start_index" and "end_index" to "lower_bound" and "upper_bound". Rewrite the attribute definitions and remove references to lists. Remove rule WR2. **RESOLUTION:** **PROJECT LEADER RESOLUTION** Accepted. Changes in the EXPRESS resources have been implemented. They had the effect to solve this comment by introducing other wording. Implemented in the new version of ISO13584-25	ACCEPTED
USA-25-40	**AUTHOR:** Gerald Radack **CLAUSE:** 6.3.4 **CLASSIFICATION:** MINOR/EDITORIAL **DESCRIPTION**: Why are start_index and end_index defined for bag_type? A bag does not have indices. However, it does have an optional lower and upper bound, which represent the minimum and maximum number of elements in the set. Also, the attribute definitions talk about lists, but this is the bag_type. **PROPOSED SOLUTION**: Change "start_index" and "end_index" to "lower_bound" and	ACCEPTED

MEMBER BODY	COMMENTS	OBSERVATIONS OF THE PROJECT
	"upper_bound". Rewrite the attribute definitions and remove references to lists. Remove rule WR2. **RESOLUTION:**OK: Add >= 0 **PROJECT LEADER RESOLUTION** Accepted. Implemented in the new version of ISO13584-25.	
USA-25-41	**AUTHOR:** Gerald Radack **CLAUSE:** 7 **CLASSIFICATION:** MINOR/EDITORIAL **DESCRIPTION**: In the note, "This part of ISO," is incomplete. Also, the second and the third references to standards end with commas. **PROPOSED SOLUTION**: Change to "This part of ISO 13584" and remove the commas. **RESOLUTION:** **PROJECT LEADER RESOLUTION** Accepted. Implemented in the new version of ISO13584-25	ACCEPTED
USA-25-42	**AUTHOR:** Gerald Radack **CLAUSE:** 7.3 **CLASSIFICATION:** MINOR/EDITORIAL **DESCRIPTION**: There is no clause 7.2. **PROPOSED SOLUTION**: Renumber the subclauses, starting with 7.2. **RESOLUTION:** **PROJECT LEADER RESOLUTION** Accepted. Implemented in the new version of ISO13584-25	ACCEPTED
USA-25-43	**AUTHOR:** Gerald Radack **CLAUSE:** 7.3.1 **CLASSIFICATION:** MINOR/EDITORIAL **DESCRIPTION**: There is an extra "I" in "defined in I ISO 13584-24: 2000". **PROPOSED SOLUTION**: Remove the "I". **RESOLUTION:** **PROJECT LEADER RESOLUTION** Accepted. Implemented in the new version of ISO13584-25	ACCEPTED
USA-25-44	**AUTHOR:** Gerald Radack **CLAUSE:** 7.4.1 **CLASSIFICATION:** MINOR/TECHNICAL	ACCEPTED

MEMBER BODY	COMMENTS	OBSERVATIONS OF THE PROJECT
	DESCRIPTION: The name "Compatible_aggregate_type_and_value_function" is listed in the subclause header and the first paragraph, but the actual function name is "compatible_aggregate_domain_and_value". **PROPOSED SOLUTION**: Change the name in the subclause header and the first paragraph to "compatible_aggregate_domain_and_value". **RESOLUTION**: **PROJECT LEADER RESOLUTION** Accepted. Function names have been changed. Implemented in the new version of ISO13584-25	
USA-25-45	**AUTHOR:** Gerald Radack **CLAUSE:** 7.4.2 **CLASSIFICATION:** MINOR/TECHNICAL **DESCRIPTION**: This function is too long to easily understand. **PROPOSED SOLUTION**: Split into smaller functions. **RESOLUTION**: To be considered. Suggestion from G. Radack. **PROJECT LEADER RESOLUTION** Accepted. Functions have been split into different other functions by decomposition. Implemented in the new version of ISO13584-25	ACCEPTED

USA-25-46	**AUTHOR:** Gerald Radack
	CLAUSE: 7.4.2
	CLASSIFICATION: MINOR/EDITORIAL
	DESCRIPTION: The code:
	
	REPEAT i :=LOINDEX(elements) TO HIINDEX(elements) ;
	 IF NOT
	  (<EDT name>
	  IN TYPEOF(elements[i]))
	 THEN
	  RETURN(FALSE) ;
	 END_IF ;
	END_REPEAT ;
		ACCEPTED

MEMBER BODY	COMMENTS	OBSERVATIONS OF THE PROJECT
	repeats four times, with <EDT name> being 'ISO13584_INSTANCE_RESOURCE_SCHEMA.INTEGER_VALUE', 'ISO13584_INSTANCE_RESOURCE_SCHEMA.REAL_VALUE', 'ISO13584_INSTANCE_RESOURCE_SCHEMA.BOOLEAN_VALUE' and 'ISO13584_INSTANCE_RESOURCE_SCHEMA.STRING_VALUE'. **PROPOSED SOLUTION**: Replace these four occurrences with a function call, passing in the EDT name as an argument. **RESOLUTION:** **PROJECT LEADER RESOLUTION** Accepted. Modification of the function has been done according to this comment. Implemented in the new version of ISO13584-25	

USA-25-47	**AUTHOR:** Gerald Radack
	CLAUSE: 7.4.2
	CLASSIFICATION: MINOR/TECHNICAL
	DESCRIPTION: IF (
	('ISO13584_DICTIONARY_AGGREGATE_VALUE_SCHEMA.'+
	      'LIST_VALUE' IN TYPEOF (val)) OR
	('ISO13584_DICTIONARY_AGGREGATE_VALUE_SCHEMA.'+
	      'BAG_VALUE' IN TYPEOF (val)) OR
	('ISO13584_DICTIONARY_AGGREGATE_VALUE_SCHEMA.'+
	      'SET_VALUE' IN TYPEOF (val))
	  )
	AND (
	    (EXISTS(the_data_type.type_structure.end_index))
	    AND NOT
	    (HIINDEX(elements)<=the_data_type.type_structure.end_index)
	    )
	THEN
	    RETURN(FALSE) ;
	END_IF ;
		ACCEPTED

MEMBER BODY	COMMENTS	OBSERVATIONS OF THE PROJECT
	To be consistent with the previous section of code, SIZEOF should be used instead of HIINDEX. **PROPOSED SOLUTION**: **RESOLUTION**: **PROJECT LEADER RESOLUTION** Accepted. The function has been rewritten and the comment been considered. Implemented in the new version of ISO13584-25	
USA-25-48	**AUTHOR:** Gerald Radack **CLAUSE:** 7.4.2 **CLASSIFICATION:** MINOR/TECHNICAL **DESCRIPTION**: The name of the function is given as "compatible_aggregate_domain_and_value" in the function definition, the subclause header and the first paragraph. However, this function actually checks compatibility of a data type with a value. **PROPOSED SOLUTION**: Change the name in the function definition, the subclause header and the first paragraph to "compatible_aggregate_type_and_value". **RESOLUTION**: **PROJECT LEADER RESOLUTION** Accepted. Implemented in the new version of ISO13584-25	ACCEPTED
USA-25-49	**AUTHOR:** Gerald Radack **CLAUSE:** 8 **CLASSIFICATION:** MINOR/EDITORIAL **DESCRIPTION**: The formatting is incorrect on note 2. **PROPOSED SOLUTION**: Correct the formatting. **RESOLUTION**: **PROJECT LEADER RESOLUTION** Accepted. Implemented in the new version of ISO13584-25	ACCEPTED
USA-25-50	**AUTHOR:** Gerald Radack **CLAUSE:** 8 **CLASSIFICATION:** MINOR/EDITORIAL **DESCRIPTION**: The table header boxes do not match up with the boxes on the following rows. **PROPOSED SOLUTION**: **RESOLUTION**: **PROJECT LEADER RESOLUTION**	ACCEPTED

	Date 2001-12-03	ISO/CD 13584 - 25
	Secretariat ANSI/NIST	ISO TC184/SC4/WG2 N559

MEMBER BODY	COMMENTS	OBSERVATIONS OF THE PROJECT
	Accepted. Implemented in the new version of ISO13584-25	
USA-25-51	**AUTHOR:** Gerald Radack **CLAUSE:** 8.1.1 **CLASSIFICATION:** MINOR/TECHNICAL **DESCRIPTION**: "This clause specifies the EXPRESS schema that uses elements either from the integrated resourceseries of ISO 10303 or from the logical resource or description methodology series of parts of ISO 13584 to define the requirements of library integrated information model LIIM 25, in conformance class 0." Why the word "either"? Is the set of elements used not fixed in the schema declaration? **PROPOSED SOLUTION**: List the specific schemas from which elements are taken, connected by "and" not "or". **RESOLUTION:** **PROJECT LEADER RESOLUTION** Accepted. Implemented in the new version of ISO13584-25	ACCEPTED
USA-25-52	**AUTHOR:** Gerald Radack **CLAUSE:** 8.1.1 **CLASSIFICATION:** MINOR/TECHNICAL **DESCRIPTION**: "Requirements stated in the following ISO13584_short_form_CC0_schema schema apply exclusively to those items that are used from this schema." It is not clear with this means. **PROPOSED SOLUTION**: Clarify. **RESOLUTION:** Accepted. Drop paragraph. **PROJECT LEADER RESOLUTION** Accepted. Implemented in the new version of ISO13584-25	ACCEPTED
USA-25-53	**AUTHOR:** Gerald Radack **CLAUSE:** 8.1.1 **CLASSIFICATION:** MINOR/EDITORIAL **DESCRIPTION**: There is a space missing between the clause number and the clause title in the header. **PROPOSED SOLUTION**: Add the space. **RESOLUTION:** **PROJECT LEADER RESOLUTION**	ACCEPTED

Date 2001-12-03	ISO/CD 13584 - 25
Secretariat ANSI/NIST	ISO TC184/SC4/WG2 N559

MEMBER BODY	COMMENTS	OBSERVATIONS OF THE PROJECT
	Accepted. Implemented in the new version of ISO13584-25	
USA-25-54	**AUTHOR:** Gerald Radack **CLAUSE:** 8.1.1.1.1 **CLASSIFICATION:** MINOR/EDITORIAL **DESCRIPTION**: The comma should not be included in "contribute, to". **PROPOSED SOLUTION**: Remove the comma. **RESOLUTION:** **PROJECT LEADER RESOLUTION** No longer applicable. This class no longer exists in the new version of ISO 13584 – 25.	ACCEPTED
USA-25-55	**AUTHOR:** Gerald Radack **CLAUSE:** 8.1.2 **CLASSIFICATION:** MINOR/EDITORIAL **DESCRIPTION**: "uses elements from either": see **ISSUE** XX on clause 8.1.1. **PROPOSED SOLUTION**: **RESOLUTION:** **PROJECT LEADER RESOLUTION** No longer applicable. This class no longer exists in the new version of ISO 13584 – 25.	NO LONGER APPLICABLE
USA-25-56	**AUTHOR:** Gerald Radack **CLAUSE:** 8.1.2 **CLASSIFICATION:** MINOR/TECHNICAL **DESCRIPTION**: "Requirements stated in the following ISO13584_short_form_CC1_schema schema apply exclusively to those items that are used from this schema." It is not clear what this means. **PROPOSED SOLUTION**: Clarify. **RESOLUTION:** **PROJECT LEADER RESOLUTION** No longer applicable. This sentence no longer exists in the new version of ISO 13584 – 25	NO LONGER APPLICABLE
USA-25-57	**AUTHOR:** Gerald Radack **CLAUSE:** 8.1.2 **CLASSIFICATION:** MINOR/EDITORIAL **DESCRIPTION**: "Conformance class 1 addresses those implementations that are intended to support the common requirements stated in the ISO/IEC dictionary and in the	ACCEPTED

MEMBER BODY	COMMENTS	OBSERVATIONS OF THE PROJECT
	ISO13584_extended_dicionary_schema schema." It does not matter what an implementation "intends" to do. Does a schema really state requirements? Are there not some other requirements in the associated text? Also, since the ISO13584_extended_dicionary_schema is an extension of the ISO/IEC dictionary, it is redundant to list both. Finally, the name of the ISO/IEC dictionary schema should be given. **PROPOSED SOLUTION**: Change to: "Conformance class 1 addresses those implementations that support the ISO13584_extended_dicionary_schema and associated requirements. NOTE: The ISO13584_extended_dicionary_schema is an extension of the ISO13584_IEC61360_dictionary_schema." **RESOLUTION:** Conformance class 1 addresses those implementations that support both the ISO13584_IEC61360_dictionary_schema and the ISO13584_extended_dicionary_schema and associated requirements. **PROJECT LEADER RESOLUTION** Accepted. Implemented in the new version of ISO13584-25	
USA-25-58	**AUTHOR:** Gerald Radack **CLAUSE:** 8.1.3 **CLASSIFICATION:** MINOR/EDITORIAL **DESCRIPTION**: There is a space missing between the clause number and the clause title in the header. **PROPOSED SOLUTION**: Add the space. **RESOLUTION:** **PROJECT LEADER RESOLUTION** Accepted. Implemented in the new version of ISO13584-25	ACCEPTED
USA-25-59	**AUTHOR:** Gerald Radack **CLAUSE:** 8.1.3 **CLASSIFICATION:** MINOR/EDITORIAL **DESCRIPTION**: "Conformance class 2 addresses those implementations that support conformance class 1 and may support aggregate data types and values." This paragraph is improperly indented. **PROPOSED SOLUTION**: Fix the indenting. **RESOLUTION:**	ACCEPTED

	Date 2001-12-03	ISO/CD 13584 - 25
	Secretariat ANSI/NIST	ISO TC184/SC4/WG2 N559

MEMBER BODY	COMMENTS	OBSERVATIONS OF THE PROJECT
	PROJECT LEADER RESOLUTION Accepted. Implemented in the new version of ISO13584-25	
USA-25-60	**AUTHOR:** Gerald Radack **CLAUSE:** 8.1.3 **CLASSIFICATION:** MINOR/EDITORIAL **DESCRIPTION**: "uses elements from either": see **ISSUE** XX on clause 8.1.1. **PROPOSED SOLUTION**: **RESOLUTION:** **PROJECT LEADER RESOLUTION** No longer applicable. This class no longer exists in the new version of ISO 13584 – 25.	NO LONGER APPLICABLE
USA-25-61	**AUTHOR:** Gerald Radack **CLAUSE:** 8.1.3 **CLASSIFICATION:** MINOR/TECHNICAL **DESCRIPTION**: "Conformance class 2 addresses those implementations that support conformance class 1 and may support aggregate data types and values." I do not understand the use of "may". Does not the conformance class require support of aggregate data types and values? If not, what use is it? **PROPOSED SOLUTION**: Clarify. **RESOLUTION:**and that support aggregate data types and values. **PROJECT LEADER RESOLUTION** Accepted. Implemented in the new version of ISO13584-25	ACCEPTED
USA-25-62	**AUTHOR:** Gerald Radack **CLAUSE:** **CLASSIFICATION:** MINOR/EDITORIAL **DESCRIPTION**: "Other conformance classes shall only support…": The word "shall" should appear only when stating a requirement. **PROPOSED SOLUTION**: Delete the word "shall". **RESOLUTION:** **PROJECT LEADER RESOLUTION** Accepted. Corrected where it appears. Implemented in the new version of ISO13584-25	ACCEPTED
USA-25-63	**AUTHOR:** Gerald Radack **CLAUSE:** 8.1.3 **CLASSIFICATION:** MINOR/EDITORIAL	NO LONGER APPLICABLE

MEMBER BODY	COMMENTS	OBSERVATIONS OF THE PROJECT
	DESCRIPTION: "Requirements stated in the following ISO13584_short_form_CC2_schema schema apply exclusively to those items that are used from this schema." It is not clear what this means. **PROPOSED SOLUTION**: Clarify. **RESOLUTION**: **PROJECT LEADER RESOLUTION** No longer applicable. This sentence no longer exists in the new version of ISO 13584 – 25.	
USA-25-64	**AUTHOR**: Gerald Radack **CLAUSE**: 8.1.3.1.1 **CLASSIFICATION**: MINOR/EDITORIAL **DESCRIPTION**: "This rule ensures that all content_items that might contribute, through inheritance, to the definition of a class shall be available in an exchange context if all the dictionary_elements that describe this class and all its superclass are available in this exchange context." The word shall should only be used when stating requirements. **PROPOSED SOLUTION**: Change "shall be" to "are". **RESOLUTION**: **PROJECT LEADER RESOLUTION** No longer applicable. This rule no longer exists in the new version of ISO 13584 – 25.	NO LONGER APPLICABLE
USA-25-65	**AUTHOR**: Gerald Radack **CLAUSE**: 8.1.4 **CLASSIFICATION**: MINOR/EDITORIAL **DESCRIPTION**: "Conformance class 3 addresses those implementations that support conformance class 1 and explicit description of class extensions by means of the definition of their set of instances." The paragraph is indented improperly. **PROPOSED SOLUTION**: Fix the indenting. **RESOLUTION**: **PROJECT LEADER RESOLUTION** Accepted. Implemented in the new version of ISO13584-25	ACCEPTED
USA-25-66	**AUTHOR**: Gerald Radack **CLAUSE**: 8.1.4 **CLASSIFICATION**: MINOR/EDITORIAL **DESCRIPTION**: There is a space missing between the clause number and the clause title in the	ACCEPTED

MEMBER BODY	COMMENTS	OBSERVATIONS OF THE PROJECT
	header. **PROPOSED SOLUTION**: Add the space. **RESOLUTION:** **PROJECT LEADER RESOLUTION** Accepted. Implemented in the new version of ISO13584-25	
USA-25-67	**AUTHOR:** Gerald Radack **CLAUSE:** 8.1.4 **CLASSIFICATION:** MINOR/EDITORIAL **DESCRIPTION**: "Requirements stated in the following ISO13584_short_form_CC3_schema schema apply exclusively to those items that are used from this schema." What does this mean? **PROPOSED SOLUTION**: Clarify. **RESOLUTION:** **PROJECT LEADER RESOLUTION** No longer applicable. This sentence no longer exists in the new version of ISO 13584 – 25.	ACCEPTED
USA-25-68	**AUTHOR:** Gerald Radack **CLAUSE:** 8.1.4.1.1 **CLASSIFICATION:** MINOR/EDITORIAL **DESCRIPTION**: "This rule ensures that all content_items that might contribute, through inheritance, to the definition of a class shall be available in an exchange context if all the dictionary_elements that describe this class and all its superclass are available in this exchange context." The word shall should only be used when stating requirements. **PROPOSED SOLUTION**: Change "shall be" to "are". **RESOLUTION:** **PROJECT LEADER RESOLUTION** No longer applicable. This rule no longer exists in the new version of ISO 13584 – 25.	NO LONGER APPLICABLE
USA-25-69	**AUTHOR:** Gerald Radack **CLAUSE:** 8.1.5 **CLASSIFICATION:** MINOR/EDITORIAL **DESCRIPTION**: "Conformance class 4 addresses those implementations that support conformance class 2 and explicit description of class extensions by means of the definition of their set of instances." The paragraph is improperly indented. **PROPOSED SOLUTION**: Fix the indenting.	ACCEPTED

MEMBER BODY	COMMENTS	OBSERVATIONS OF THE PROJECT
	RESOLUTION: **PROJECT LEADER RESOLUTION** Accepted. Implemented in the new version of ISO13584-25	
USA-25-70	**AUTHOR:** Gerald Radack **CLAUSE:** 8.1.5 **CLASSIFICATION:** MINOR/EDITORIAL **DESCRIPTION**: There is a space missing between the clause number and the clause title in the header. **PROPOSED SOLUTION**: Add the space. **RESOLUTION:** **PROJECT LEADER RESOLUTION** Accepted. Implemented in the new version of ISO13584-25	ACCEPTED
USA-25-71	**AUTHOR:** Gerald Radack **CLAUSE:** 8.1.5.1.1 **CLASSIFICATION:** MINOR/EDITORIAL **DESCRIPTION**: "This rule ensures that all content_items that might contribute, through inheritance, to the definition of a class shall be available in an exchange context if all the dictionary_elements that describe this class and all its superclass are available in this exchange context." The word shall should only be used when stating requirements. **PROPOSED SOLUTION**: Change "shall be" to "are". **RESOLUTION:** **PROJECT LEADER RESOLUTION** No longer applicable. This rule no longer exists in the new version of ISO 13584 – 25.	NO LONGER APPLICABLE
USA-25-72	**AUTHOR:** Gerald Radack **CLAUSE:** Annex A **CLASSIFICATION:** MINOR/EDITORIAL **DESCRIPTION**: There should be a blank line before the URL in note 2. **PROPOSED SOLUTION**: Add the blank line. **RESOLUTION:** **PROJECT LEADER RESOLUTION** Accepted. Implemented in the new version of ISO13584-25	ACCEPTED
USA-25-73	**AUTHOR:** Gerald Radack	ACCEPTED

	Date 2001-12-03	ISO/CD 13584 - 25
	Secretariat ANSI/NIST	ISO TC184/SC4/WG2 N559

MEMBER BODY	COMMENTS	OBSERVATIONS OF THE PROJECT
	CLAUSE: Annex A **CLASSIFICATION:** MINOR/EDITORIAL **DESCRIPTION**: There is a period missing at the end of the first paragraph. **PROPOSED SOLUTION**: Add the period. **RESOLUTION:** **PROJECT LEADER RESOLUTION** Accepted. Implemented in the new version of ISO13584-25	
USA-25-74	**AUTHOR:** Gerald Radack **CLAUSE:** Annex A **CLASSIFICATION:** MINOR/EDITORIAL **DESCRIPTION**: "In these listings, all the elements used either from the integrated resources of ISO 10303 (ISO 10303-4x) or from the logical resource or description methodology series of parts of ISO 13584 (ISO 13584-2x and ISO 13584-4x) and the constraints defined in the short forms specified in clause 8 and in the normative annex B gathered in an unique schema without any external reference." The sentence is too long, and there is no verb. The fact that they use elements "either from the integrated resources of ISO 10303 (ISO 10303-4x) or from the logical resource or description methodology series of parts of ISO 13584 (ISO 13584-2x and ISO 13584-4x" is irrelevant here; that was already stated in clause 8. **PROPOSED SOLUTION**: Change to: "Each expanded listing in this annex incorporates all the elements that the corresponding short form schema in clause 8 uses from other schemas into a single schema without any external references." **RESOLUTION:** **PROJECT LEADER RESOLUTION** Accepted. Replaced in annex which is annex C in the new version of ISO 13584.	ACCEPTED
USA-25-75	**AUTHOR:** Gerald Radack **CLAUSE:** Annex A **CLASSIFICATION:** MINOR/EDITORIAL **DESCRIPTION**: "These schemas may be used to exchange libraries that does not reference any view exchange protocol, as specified in annex B of this part of ISO 13584": inccorect plurality for "does". Also, it is unclear what is being specified in annex B. Finally, there is a period missing at the end of the sentence. **PROPOSED SOLUTION**: Change "does" to "do", clarify what is being specfied in annex B, and	ACCEPTED

	Date 2001-12-03	ISO/CD 13584 - 25
	Secretariat ANSI/NIST	ISO TC184/SC4/WG2 N559

MEMBER BODY	COMMENTS	OBSERVATIONS OF THE PROJECT
	add a period at the end of the sentence. **RESOLUTION:** **PROJECT LEADER RESOLUTION** Accepted. Replaced in annex which is annex C in the new version of ISO 13584.	
USA-25-76	**AUTHOR:** Gerald Radack **CLAUSE:** Annex B **CLASSIFICATION:** MINOR/EDITORIAL **DESCRIPTION**: The word "the" is unnecessary in front of "library integrated information model." **PROPOSED SOLUTION**: Delete the word "the". **RESOLUTION:** **PROJECT LEADER RESOLUTION** Accepted. Implemented in the new version of ISO13584-25	ACCEPTED
USA-25-77	**AUTHOR:** Gerald Radack **CLAUSE:** Annex B **CLASSIFICATION:** MINOR/EDITORIAL **DESCRIPTION**: "...standard data that shall be fulfilled by any library": The word "shall" should be reserved for stating requirements. **PROPOSED SOLUTION**: Change "shall" to "must." **RESOLUTION:** **PROJECT LEADER RESOLUTION** Accepted. Implemented in the new version of ISO13584-25	ACCEPTED
USA-25-78	**AUTHOR:** Gerald Radack **CLAUSE:** Annex B **CLASSIFICATION:** MINOR/TECHNICAL **DESCRIPTION**: "...identifies the functional view class possibly defined…": The word "possibly" is ambigous. **PROPOSED SOLUTION**: Clarify. **RESOLUTION:** **PROJECT LEADER RESOLUTION** Accepted. Replaced "which may be defined …." in the new version of ISO13584-25	ACCEPTED
USA-25-79	**AUTHOR:** Gerald Radack **CLAUSE:** Annex B	ACCEPTED

MEMBER BODY	COMMENTS	OBSERVATIONS OF THE PROJECT
	CLASSIFICATION: MINOR/TECHNICAL **DESCRIPTION**: "...represents a value equal external_file_protocol shall be processed...": what does "value equal" mean? **PROPOSED SOLUTION**: Change to: "...represents an external_file_protocol that is value-equal, as defined in ISO 10303-11 clause XX, shall be processed…" **RESOLUTION:** **PROJECT LEADER RESOLUTION** Accepted. Corrected in annex D. Implemented in the new version of ISO13584-25	
USA-25-80	**AUTHOR:** Gerald Radack **CLAUSE:** Annex B **CLASSIFICATION:** MINOR/TECHNICAL **DESCRIPTION**: 'Recognition of a basic_semantic_unit means that the corresponding basic_semantic_unit": How does a basic_semantic_unit correspond to another basic_semantic_unit? **PROPOSED SOLUTION**: Clarify. **RESOLUTION:** **PROJECT LEADER RESOLUTION** Accepted. Corrected. The sentence became "… Recognition of the received basic_semantic_unit …." Implemented in the new version of ISO13584-25	ACCEPTED
USA-25-81	**AUTHOR:** Gerald Radack **CLAUSE:** Annex B **CLASSIFICATION:** MINOR/TECHNICAL **DESCRIPTION**: "…shall be already stored in the user system…": The term "user system" is not defined in this part. **PROPOSED SOLUTION**: Define user system or reword this sentence. **RESOLUTION:**shall be already stored in the user library **PROJECT LEADER RESOLUTION** And the definition of the "user library " has been defined. Implemented in the new version of ISO13584-25	ACCEPTED
USA-25-82	**AUTHOR:** Gerald Radack **CLAUSE:** Annex B.1 **CLASSIFICATION:** MINOR/EDITORIAL **DESCRIPTION**: Space missing between "class 1 to 4" and "are defined."	NO LONGER APPLICABLE

MEMBER BODY	COMMENTS	OBSERVATIONS OF THE PROJECT
	PROPOSED SOLUTION: Add the space. **RESOLUTION:** **PROJECT LEADER RESOLUTION** No longer applicable.	
USA-25-83	**AUTHOR:** Gerald Radack **CLAUSE:** Annex B.1 **CLASSIFICATION:** MINOR/EDITORIAL **DESCRIPTION**: There is a period missing at the end of the paragraph beginning with: "Moreover, according to its conformance class." **PROPOSED SOLUTION**: Add a period. **RESOLUTION:** **PROJECT LEADER RESOLUTION** No longer applicable.	NO LONGER APPLICABLE
USA-25-84	**AUTHOR:** Gerald Radack **CLAUSE:** Annex B.1 **CLASSIFICATION:** MINOR/TECHNICAL **DESCRIPTION**: "...is implicitly defined as folows": What is the significance of the word "implicitly"? **PROPOSED SOLUTION**: Clarify. **RESOLUTION:** **PROJECT LEADER RESOLUTION** No longer applicable.	NO LONGER APPLICABLE
USA-25-85	**AUTHOR:** Gerald Radack **CLAUSE:** Annex B.1 **CLASSIFICATION:** MINOR/EDITORIAL **DESCRIPTION**: Improper indenting of the bullet item immediately above the line "SCHEMA ISO13584_25_library_implicit_schema." **PROPOSED SOLUTION**: **RESOLUTION:** **PROJECT LEADER RESOLUTION** No longer applicable.	NO LONGER APPLICABLE
USA-25-86	**AUTHOR:** Gerald Radack	ACCEPTED

	Date 2001-12-03	ISO/CD 13584 - 25
	Secretariat ANSI/NIST	ISO TC184/SC4/WG2 N559

MEMBER BODY	COMMENTS	OBSERVATIONS OF THE PROJECT
	CLAUSE: Annex B.1 **CLASSIFICATION:** MINOR/EDITORIAL **DESCRIPTION**: "Table B.1, that specifies": Incorrect use of the word "that." **PROPOSED SOLUTION**: Change "that" to "which." **RESOLUTION:** **PROJECT LEADER RESOLUTION** Accepted. Implemented in the new version of ISO13584-25	
USA-25-87	**AUTHOR:** Gerald Radack **CLAUSE:** Annex B.1 **CLASSIFICATION:** MINOR/EDITORIAL **DESCRIPTION**: "and no ISO 13584_25_cci_schema": The word "no" is used incorrectly. **PROPOSED SOLUTION**: Change "no" to "not." **RESOLUTION:** **PROJECT LEADER RESOLUTION** No longer applicable.	NO LONGER APPLICABLE
USA-25-88	**AUTHOR:** Gerald Radack **CLAUSE:** Annex B.2 **CLASSIFICATION:** MINOR/EDITORIAL **DESCRIPTION**: "model 25 in either of its conformance classes": Either implies that there are only two. **PROPOSED SOLUTION**: Change "either" to "any." **RESOLUTION:** **PROJECT LEADER RESOLUTION** Accepted. Implemented in the new version of ISO13584-25	ACCEPTED